

CARLTON UNITED BREWERY EXPERT ADVISORY PANEL

REPORT TO

HON. FRANK SARTOR

MINISTER FOR PLANNING

Minister,

We have pleasure in submitting our report on the important site between Broadway and Chippendale known as the Carlton & United Brewery. The Panel has met frequently to consider options for the site, including meetings with community representatives, stakeholders, the reference panel and the applicant.

As a result of these meetings we make the following 27 recommendations to you to give certainty to the site's potential development. In our view these will ensure an appropriate quality of development that responds to the surrounding communities and built form.

Chris Johnson
Panel Chair

Neil Bird

Michael Collins

Lucy Turnbull

CARLTON UNITED BREWERY EXPERT ADVISORY PANEL REPORT

TO THE MINISTER FOR PLANNING

Introduction

The Carlton & United Brewery site is a 5.795 hectare parcel located at the south western entry to the City of Sydney. It represents the largest remaining brown field site within close proximity to the Sydney CBD.

The opportunity to re develop the site has arisen after many years of industrial use, with the parameters for re development being the subject of much discussion over the last four years. In June, 2006 the Minister for Planning appointed an expert advisory panel to consider such re development from an urban design perspective and make recommendations to the Minister..

The panel has met on numerous occasions and considered the previous design competition submissions and jury report. A stakeholder reference panel was convened which included representatives from a wide range of interested parties including local residents, businesses, educational organisations, relevant public authorities and major land owners. The reference panel met twice, undertook tours of the site and surrounding area and raised issues of concern for the expert advisory panel's consideration. The applicant also made a presentation to the Reference panel. A public meeting attended by more than 100 people was also convened.

Over 30 written submissions have been received by the expert advisory panel during the process, which crystallised the issues of interest into the following general areas:

- Location of the park
- Heritage issues
- Building height and form
- Maximum density
- Street layout, traffic management and parking
- Proportion of land uses within the site
- Solar access
- Impact of the re development both within and without the site.

Community Stakeholders

The Panel's investigations found that a number of community stakeholders surround the site and that all of these should be considered in the ultimate design solution. These include:

- The Chippendale residential community (3,240 people according to 2001 census), who live in a variety of housing and apartment types.
- The Chippendale working community who occupy mainly warehouse buildings and include a number of small businesses, design firms and artist's studios.
- The student community from nearby Universities and the TAFE College (58,250 students in Ultimo and a further 45,000 students at Sydney University), which when combined with teaching and other staff represent a substantial number of people. These tertiary institutions occupy the existing high rise tower of UTS as well as many medium rise buildings in the area. Student housing is also an important part of the local fabric.
- The mixed use business community located on Broadway adjacent to the site, including a number of small / large Hotels (including the Mercure). This business community extends from Railway Square to the Broadway Shopping Centre and includes a variety of retail and commercial activities.

As a result of this consultative process, presentations from and discussions with the applicant, the expert advisory panel has gained a strong understanding of the relevant issues. This report delineates the Panel's consideration of the opportunities and constraints of the site and provides its recommendations to the Minister.

Context

The site should act as a transitional precinct between the Central Business District and the inner city suburb of Chippendale which is characterised by terrace house and medium density early industrial architecture of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The objective of achieving a transition is reflected in the present City of Sydney planning controls which provide for a density of 5:1 for residential development (3:1 commercial). This density is, however too great to achieve an outcome of high quality and high amenity urban design which will complement and enhance the neighbourhood.

The buildings proposed on each of the site's four boundaries should have a contextual relationship with the adjacent urban form especially on the opposite sides of the streets, without necessarily being identical to them.

Much of the infill residential development of the past decade in the Chippendale precinct has had regard for and respects the dominant industrial medium density form. The panel believes that this relationship should be continued on the site.

Within the existing form and context of Chippendale there is fine grained architectural language with a great deal of diversity of form and this diversity should be reflected in the development. A wide mix of architectural languages and styles is desirable so the fine grain can be maintained.

To the north and east of the site many large buildings have been constructed for hotels, apartments, universities and cultural uses. The tallest building is the UTS tower at 110 metres, which was originally planned as one of a group of towers. A number of these buildings are above 45 metres in height.

The location of the park & heritage precinct is a significant determinant of the built form.

Park Location, Use & Amenity

The panel has reviewed a number of locations for the proposed park. These include suggestions from the design competition schemes, the applicant and from the wider community.

The park is to have an area of approximately 5000m² and serve a number of functions inclusive of the needs of the residents and workers on site and the wider community of students and Chippendale residents. In looking at the location opportunities and constraints, the panel was mindful of traffic, safety of use, noise, pollution and wind impacts as well as the need to ensure access and integration to / with the wider community. The park also needs to achieve appropriate levels of solar access, particularly during winter and passive surveillance to ensure the maximisation of use.

Recommendations

1. The park should be located on the southern boundary central to the site with public streets on all sides.
2. Buildings around the park should match the heights of heritage buildings No. 22 & 23 resulting in heights to a maximum of 25 metres.
3. To maximise sun to the park between 12 & 2 pm in winter building heights throughout the site should maintain an appropriate sun access plane.

4. Development across the site should also maintain an appropriate sun access plane in order to minimise overshadowing of the surrounding Chippendale buildings between 12 & 2pm in winter.

Heritage Issues

The site contains buildings and structures of varying heritage significance. A substantial amount of investigative work has been undertaken by consultants both for the applicant and independently for various bodies, including the Heritage Council of NSW.

The panel has been provided with the opportunity to review this work including the Conservation Management Plan for the site that has recently been adopted by the Heritage Council. The panel generally supports the recommendations of that document and suggests that the following principles should be adhered to in the re development of the site.

Recommendations

5. The Heritage focus should be on the brewery square with the retention and adaptive reuse of buildings numbered in the adopted Conservation Plan as 30, 26, 36, 22 & 23 and the brewery yard 52.
6. Other heritage buildings of moderate heritage significance which generally have a lack of integrity and intactness could be removed if they provide the opportunity to deliver better urban design outcomes for the site. These include those numbered 35A, 35B, 32 & 13A.

Building Height and Form

The site is important as an entry point to the Sydney CBD and forms a transition between the city centre and the lower scale of the suburb of Chippendale. It needs to respect the urban design of both and the scale and nature of each.

It provides a unique brown fields re development opportunity adjacent to one of the busiest public transport hubs in the State and can achieve employment and residential outcomes of great benefit to the wider community. Panel members have considered a range of options in terms of building height and separation as well as the site's spatial layout.

The built form of the ultimate re development should be capable of delivering a sustainable outcome for both its occupants and those who will seek to use its facilities or simply pass through it. In this regard the panel believes that higher building form should be located in the north eastern corner of the site, with heights tapering downwards in a south westerly direction. The Panel believes there are strong urban design reasons for higher building form on Broadway as well as the benefit of removing development pressure from other parts of the site.

The following recommendations are suggested as a balanced approach to achieve these principles

Recommendations

7. Buildings on the southern boundary of the site should be a maximum of 15 metres to relate to the warehouses and related buildings in Chippendale.
8. Buildings on the western site boundary along Abercrombie Street should be 20 - 25 metres high at the property boundary, to act as a transitional form on this boundary. The actual height should have regard to the buildings on the western side of Abercrombie Street and the existing Brewery buildings.

9. Buildings on Broadway on the northern site boundary west of Balfour Street should be 45 meters high to relate to the 42 metre height limit on the other side of Broadway, and include an articulation at the 25 metre high level to complement the proposed podium height on the eastern side of Balfour Street.
10. Buildings on Broadway on the northern site boundary east of Balfour Street should have a 25 metre podium with a maximum of 2 towers above. The buildings should sit below the FAC height limit and be separated by a minimum distance of 25 metres. The towers will relate to the height of the UTS Tower, act as a gateway to the city and provide the benefit of removing development pressure from other parts of the site.
11. Buildings on the western side of Old Kent Road, south of the proposed towers on Broadway, should be restricted to a maximum of 45 metres
12. Buildings on the eastern side of Old Kent Road, located adjacent to the south of the heritage listed Administration Buildings (numbered 10A and 10B in the Conservation Plan) should match the heights of those buildings.
13. New buildings on both the eastern and western sides of Kensington Street located between the buildings mentioned in recommendation 11 above and the northern side of Outram Street should be to a maximum height of 25 metres.
14. Additional height to the above recommendations may be possible if set back from the building within a 45 degree set back from the dominant street. Roof top developments as well as being set back should not be visually dominant from the adjoining street or increase shadows on parks or the Brewery Courtyard.

Design excellence

As the site is in such a significant location and its size is unique in terms of city development opportunities, design excellence is essential to achieve an outstanding built form outcome

15. Architectural competitions should be held for all buildings over 25 metres in height. For the two towers on Broadway the competition should include international architects
16. To ensure design quality across the whole site for all buildings and the public domain, a Design Review Panel should be established to be involved in the design development and to provide recommendations to the approval authority. The panel should also be involved in assessing the architectural competitions and in ensuring that design quality follows through to the completed works.
17. A variety of architects and urban designers should be used across the site to ensure visual diversity. The selection of architects should be endorsed by the Design Review Panel.

Street Layout

The street layout for the site has a number of functions and must be derived within a number of constraints. Firstly, it needs to relate to the wider road system in which it will be located, bearing in mind the volumes of traffic and importance of the surrounding road pattern.

The layout should reflect the historic patterns of use within the site and the spatial layout of the surrounding Chippendale area. It must provide for the safe and practical movement of people and vehicles within the site and meet the necessary statutory and design requirements. In view of these issues the panel makes the following recommendations.

Recommendations

18. The street layout should have two streets parallel to Broadway, spaced to relate to the heritage buildings, with a further street relating to the extension of O'Connor Street on the eastern sector of the site.
19. Streets perpendicular to Broadway should be based on Balfour Street with two narrow streets at block mid points east and west of Balfour. Care needs to be taken in the planning of the narrow streets to ensure safety.
20. Street edges should contain active uses particularly within the proposed narrow north south streets where issues of public amenity and safety may arise.
21. The street layout should relate to surrounding areas by maximising pedestrian linkages while avoiding short cuts for traffic.
22. The street layout should be designed to meet the necessary statutory and design requirements in relation to traffic management within and without the site.

General Issues

The panel has considered a number of general issues and principles that it believes should be incorporated into the regulatory framework to be applied to the re development of the site.

Recommendations

23. Car Parking should comply with the City Council's car parking code and the number of entry points to car parks from the street should be minimised.
24. The concept plan approved for the site should achieve the following SEPP 65 compliance levels for solar access within individual buildings within each proposed street block. The panel considers that achievement of 70% compliance for the overall site with no block below 60% would be acceptable in the consideration of the highly urbanised location of the site.
25. There should be a diversity of uses within the site to reflect the range of commercial, residential and educational activities in the nearby area including the opportunity for student housing. Commercial space should be concentrated on Broadway to create a buffer for the residential area
26. To ensure a diversity of uses the minimum proportion of either commercial or residential development within the site should be 30%.
27. The concept plan approval for the site shall nominate the maximum gross floor area available within each street block to ensure that the maximum site FSR is not breached. The bulk, scale, height and density of buildings within each street block should conform to the design principles enumerated in the panel's recommendations.



The panel recommends that heritage buildings around the brewery yard be used to demonstrate the processes of the Irving Street brewery including the brew house, where the crushed malt was mixed with hot water, the malt silo and the coal fired boiler house.



The panel recommends that the community park be located in the centre of the site on the southern boundary to be close to the Chippendale community, with surrounding buildings matching the scale of the heritage buildings.